

## Article

# Maillard de Tournon: The First Papal Legate to China (1702–1710) and His Unknown Manuscripts

Rui Zhang

Department of History, East China Normal University; Shanghai 200241, China; rzhang@history.ecnu.edu.cn

**Abstract:** The *Istoria della spedizione del Cardinale Carlo Tommaso Maillard de' Tournon* is a collection of manuscripts produced for and circulated within the Roman Curia in the early 18th century. It contains letters and reports from Maillard de Tournon, the first papal legate to China, and records his mission and the early efforts of the Holy See to establish direct contact with the Qing court, bypassing the patronage system and locally entrenched religious orders (the Jesuits in particular). For various reasons, these manuscripts were never fully published and, in spite of their interest, remain relatively unknown to scholars. This article introduces these manuscripts, edited by Giovanni Giacomo Fatinielli, procurator of Maillard de Tournon in Rome, and demonstrates their value in allowing a greater understanding of the relationship between the Holy See and China, as well as the general relationship between the Holy See and Catholic missionaries throughout the world.

**Keywords:** Holy See; China; Charles Thomas Maillard de Tournon; Kangxi; Giovanni Giacomo Fatinielli; Catholicism; missionary; Chinese Rites Controversy



**Citation:** Zhang, Rui. 2022. Maillard de Tournon: The First Papal Legate to China (1702–1710) and His Unknown Manuscripts. *Religions* 13: 1137. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel13121137>

Academic Editor: Dyron B. Daugherty

Received: 21 October 2022  
Accepted: 21 November 2022  
Published: 23 November 2022

**Publisher's Note:** MDPI stays neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.



**Copyright:** © 2022 by the author. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).

## 1. Introduction

The *Istoria della spedizione del Cardinale Carlo Tommaso Maillard de' Tournon Visitatore e Commissario Generale alle Missioni della Cina, ed altri Regni delle Indie Orientali* (hereafter *Istoria della spedizione*)<sup>1</sup> is a collection of manuscripts, edited in the early 18th century by Giovanni Giacomo Fatinielli (1653–1736), concerning the first papal legate, Charles Thomas Maillard de Tournon (Duo Luo 多羅, 1668–1710), who visited China during the reign of Emperor Kangxi (康熙, 1654–1722) of the Qing dynasty. The manuscripts, with an original and a full copy totaling six volumes, are now preserved in the Casanatense Library (Biblioteca Casanatense) in Rome, Italy. The manuscripts introduce, present, describe, and analyze Maillard de Tournon's mission to China.

The staff of the Casanatense Library began to compile new catalogues of their manuscript holdings in the mid-20th century (Caputo 1949; Ceccopieri 1988a), including those relating to the Catholic missions in China (Ceccopieri 1988b, 1996, 2022). In the 1950s and 1960s, a portion of the documents were microfilmed by Fr. Francis Rouleau S.J., who then sent them to the library of the Ricci Institute for Chinese–Western Cultural History, which was first at the University of San Francisco, but is now at Boston College (USA).<sup>2</sup> Eugenio Menegon later contributed an inventory of the discovered manuscript documents and books related to China's Catholic mission during the 17th and 18th centuries. The work of Menegon has provided a useful tool allowing interested scholars to find new material, although Menegon limited himself only to a crude description of the items in his inventory (Menegon 2000, pp. 31–55).

These manuscripts, though interesting and valuable, have remained relatively unknown and under-used for a variety of reasons (Menegon 2000, p. 31). Due to the quantity of the material and the variety of languages contained in the manuscripts, scholars require not only a profound knowledge of Catholic missionary activities in China, but also several European languages in their Early Modern versions. In addition to items in Latin, they contain sections in Old Italian, French, Spanish, and Portuguese. Thus far, few scholars

have studied this material. Foremost among those who have are Fortunato Margiotti, the co-editor of the series *Sinica Franciscana*, and Giacomo Di Fiore, author of *La Legazione Mezzabarbar in Cina* (Di Fiore 1989). More recently, I have also drawn upon the documents relating to Maillard de Tournon, seeking to reveal different aspects of the first papal legation to China, and the resulting narrative resulted in somewhat of a counterpoint to other historiographies, particularly those that favor Jesuit sources.

In the context of increased contact between China and the Holy See, the systematic study of these manuscripts has both historical and practical significance. In fact, Tournon's testimony has both "psychological" and documentary value, providing facts and details that had long remained obscure or unknown, particularly pertaining to the final part of his mission following his visit to Beijing. This article presents the sources and origins of the *Istoria della spedizione*, introduces the contents of the manuscripts themselves, and provides several examples of their scholarly value and potential for future work.

## 2. The Editor

The editor of the *Istoria della spedizione*, Giovanni Giacomo Fatinelli, son of Giovanni Battista and Angela Fatinelli,<sup>3</sup> was born into a noble family in the Republic of Lucca in central Italy. He studied the *utroque iure* (canon and civil law), where he obtained a doctoral degree (Asso 1995, p. 320). However, what made him famous was his becoming the procurator of Maillard de Tournon in Italy, the announcement appearing even in the *Giornale de' letterati d'Italia* (*Journal of the Italian literati*), a well-known journal among the Italian literati at the time (Maffei et al. 1710, p. 508). In 1701, Maillard de Tournon had been nominated by the Holy See to become the Patriarch of Antioch, Apostolic Visitor, and first *legatus a latere* (a legate sent "from the pope's side") to China. A year later, he left Rome and started his journey to the East with the intention of establishing more formal contact ("corrispondenza") between Rome and Beijing, to supervise the activity of the missionaries and to develop diplomatic, cultural, and human contact.<sup>4</sup> However, due to language barriers, cultural differences, and the obstruction of the Portuguese Padroado (patronage system), the ice-breaking visit of Maillard de Tournon ended in failure, and the legate himself died in Macao in 1710 at the age of 41 (Zhang 2022, p. 200).

We are not sure when exactly Fatinelli became the procurator of Maillard de Tournon, but what is clear is that he was concerned with the problems of the Catholic mission in China, especially the long-lasting Chinese Rites Controversy (Li 2019). In 1700, Fatinelli edited a book (Fatinelli 1700) titled *The History of the Cult of the Chinese, or Various Writings between French Apostolic Vicars, Other Missionaries, and the Jesuits Fathers About the Cults of the Chinese* (*Historia cultus Sinensium, seu varia scripta de cultibus Sinarum, inter vicarios apostolicos Gallos aliosque missionarios, & patres Societatis Jesu controversis*).<sup>5</sup> In this book, he collected the documents brought back from the Far East by Nicolas Charmot (Meng Nige 孟尼閣, 1655–1714), a missionary from the Missions Étrangères de Paris (MEP), among which there were also letters of Charles Maigrot (Yan Dang 顏璫, 1625–1730), apostolic vicar of Fujian in China. In 1694, Charmot was sent by Maigrot to Rome to persuade Pope Innocent XII to review the Chinese Rites Controversy, to forbid Chinese Christians from venerating Confucius and their own ancestors, and to stop the use of the words *Tian* (天) and *Shangdi* (上帝) when referring to the name of the Christian God. At first, the Roman Curia approved and supported the concept of "inculturation" promoted by the Jesuits and ignored Maigrot's suggestions. However, three years later, the papal Sacred Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith (*Sacra Congregatio de Propaganda Fide*, often known as *Propaganda Fide*) opened a new round of consultation and, subsequently, reversed their attitude toward the Chinese Rites in 1697 (Criveller 2012, p. 14).

Between the 17th and 18th centuries, the policies of the Holy See toward China changed regularly, often being swayed quite easily. One of the reasons was probably related to the rising anti-Jesuit sentiment in European society. For example, Fatinelli accused the Jesuits of discrediting the Roman Church by feeding not only its morally laxer aspects, but also the practices closest to paganism (Asso 1995, p. 320). In Fatinelli's hometown,

the Republic of Lucca, the Jesuits had repeatedly sought the pope's support to establish a college, but this was in vain. The ambassador of Lucca to the Holy See said that the Jesuits were keen to interfere in its internal affairs through education, and, therefore, the government refused their request, communicating that the local residents were mainly merchants and had no need for overly advanced education. Furthermore, the pope urged the Jesuits to restrain and restrict their own activities to what they were already doing (Sforza 1887, pp. 55–74).

In 1709, the pope received the envoy of Emperor Kangxi, Joseph Antoine Provana S.J. (Ai Ruose 艾若瑟, 1662–1720), who drafted five memoranda for Clement XI, informing him about the difficulties in the China missions and urging him to reach an agreement with Kangxi (de Saldnaha 2002, pp. 410–21; Liu 2008, p. 63). However, it is likely that under the influence of Fatinelli,<sup>6</sup> the pope was skeptical toward Provana's requests (Texeira 1994, pp. 259–69; Meynard 2018, pp. 119–27). Provana's memoranda were refuted one by one by Fatinelli in a congregation of the Holy Office in the presence of the pope (Di Fiore 2007). It was also rumored that Fatinelli had the support of Giuseppe Maria Tommasi (1649–1712), a prominent liturgical expert, known as the "Prince of the Roman liturgists" (Principe dei liturgisti Romani), in the Holy See.<sup>7</sup> Although Fatinelli's criticism of Provana was limited to circulation within the Holy Office, it eventually reached the ears of some Jesuits. Among them was Luigi Vincenzo Mamiani della Rovere (1652–1730), procurator of the assistant to Portugal of the superior general of the Society of Jesus and responsible for the Eastern missions. He decided to publish a book anonymously in order to instigate a debate with Fatinelli (della Rovere 1709), calling him an "impostor, forger, reckless, satirist, slanderer".<sup>8</sup> This was all in vain (della Rovere 1730); no matter how the Jesuits argued, they could not change the pope's mind or shake his confidence in Fatinelli. When Clement XI learned that Maillard de Tournon had died in Macao, he commissioned Fatinelli to collect the letters and reports of the Legate and edit the history about his mission to China, leading to the compilation of the manuscripts being discussed here.

According to Fatinelli, the birth of the *Istoria della spedizione* was, on the one hand, due to the exhortation of Pope Clement XI and on the other hand, due to the influence of other works, especially *El Pastor de Noche Buena* (*The Shepherd of the Good Night*), written by Spanish bishop Juan de Palafox y Mendoza (1600–1659).<sup>9</sup> Palafox y Mendoza was the bishop of the diocese of Puebla in Mexico and sought to protect Native Americans from the Spanish conquest, forbidding Europeans from forcing natives to convert to Catholicism. Such a move, however, was opposed by the Jesuits. Palafox y Mendoza wrote to Rome twice, in 1647 and 1649, complaining of the Jesuits' method of preaching. Finally, Pope Innocent X issued an edict in 1648, admonishing the Jesuits to respect the bishop's authority (Cervera and Esquivel 2018, pp. 245–84). As the Italian translator of *El Pastor de Noche Buena*, Fatinelli bluntly stated that Palafox y Mendoza and Maillard de Tournon were highly similar in their experiences (Fatinelli 1772).<sup>10</sup> It was after this that he made up his mind to edit the history of Tournon's legation (see Fatinelli 1772, especially the preface).

In Rome, Fatinelli also received help from his uncle, Fatinello Fatinelli (?–1719),<sup>11</sup> becoming the Canon of the Basilica of Saint Mary Major, and subsequently found a job in the Apostolic Penitentiary. On 18 April 1720, he was appointed diplomatic agent of the Republic of Lucca to the papal court and renewed his office at the end of each three-year period until his death. In 1721, Pope Clement XI died suddenly, and the internal turmoil in the Roman Curia forced Fatinelli to abandon the publication of the *Istoria della spedizione* in full, leaving the fate of the manuscripts hanging in the balance (Asso 1995, pp. 320–21).

### 3. The Manuscripts

On 12 September 1733, the aged Fatinelli donated his manuscripts related to Maillard de Tournon to the Casanatense Library in Rome (Zhang 2022, p. 6). The library is located in the center of Rome, right next to the Jesuit Collegio Romano. Dating back to 1701, it was founded by Cardinal Girolamo Casanate (1620–1700) and administered by the Dominicans of the convent of Saint Mary of Minerva (De Gregorio 1993). In 1870, the library came under

the control of the Italian state and 14 years later, in 1884, the Dominicans were excluded, and the Casanatense Library was put under the control of a lay librarian (Menegon 2000, p. 31).

In the Casanatense Library, manuscripts are identified by simple numbers. The codices' numbers are different from microfilm numbers (Menegon 2000, p. 37). In the Casanatense collections, the codex numbers of the original version of the *Istoria della spedizione* are 1623, 1624, and 1625, while the corresponding microfilm numbers are 1591, 1592, and 1593; additionally, the copy version numbers are 1636, 1637, and 1638, and the corresponding microfilm numbers are 1601, 1602, and 1603, as summarized in Table 1.

**Table 1.** The collection of *Istoria della spedizione* in the Casanatense Library.

| Manuscript | Microfilm | Title/Topic  |
|------------|-----------|--|
| 1623       | 1591      | Fatinelli, <i>Istoria della spedizione del Cardinale Carlo Tommaso Maillard de' Tournon Visitatore e Commissario Generale alle Missioni della Cina, ed altri Regni delle Indie Orientali</i> , vol. 1, 292 ff. |
| 1624       | 1592      | Fatinelli, <i>Istoria della spedizione del Cardinale Carlo Tommaso Maillard de' Tournon Visitatore e Commissario Generale alle Missioni della Cina, ed altri Regni delle Indie Orientali</i> , vol. 2, 277 ff. |
| 1625       | 1593      | Fatinelli, <i>Istoria della spedizione del Cardinale Carlo Tommaso Maillard de' Tournon Visitatore e Commissario Generale alle Missioni della Cina, ed altri Regni delle Indie Orientali</i> , vol. 3, 382 ff. |
| 1636       | 1601      | G.G. Fatinelli, <i>Istoria della spedizione del Card. C. T. Maillard de' Marchesi di Tournon alle Missioni della Cina</i> , Pars I, II, 224 ff.  |
| 1637       | 1602      | G.G. Fatinelli, <i>Istoria della spedizione del Card. C. T. Maillard de' Marchesi di Tournon alle Missioni della Cina</i> , Pars III, 179 ff.  |
| 1638       | 1603      | G.G. Fatinelli, <i>Istoria della spedizione del Card. C. T. Maillard de' Marchesi di Tournon alle Missioni della Cina</i> , Pars IV, 261 ff.   |

In Table 1, we can see that both the original and the copy of the *Istoria della spedizione* are divided into three volumes, recording the different stages of Maillard de Tournon's mission. The original version is in poor condition and is full of handwritten corrections in the hand of the original author, making it quite difficult to follow. Regarding the copy, the manuscript is in good condition, and the text is coherent and legible. In terms of content, the two versions are almost identical, and where corrections have been made, the editor has provided explanations written in the margins. The examples drawn upon in this article were taken from the copy. The Dominican Father Giandomenico Agnani (1681–1746), then Director of the Casanatense Library, wrote the following explanation on the title page:

In the present copy, there are some additions and alterations from the hand of the author, which are not present in the original. This copy had to pass as an original in some way. If the Holy See wants, as it is too easy, the printing of this very interesting history, it would do well to consider this copy with the original, noting the additions and small corrections made by the author. Moreover, it should be checked to find out the extent to which these corrections, alterations and additions, all small, had been suggested by Giovanni Battista Marcello Angelita,<sup>12</sup> Commissioner of the Holy Office, Canon of the Sacred Heart, who holds other writings pertaining to China.<sup>13</sup>

In the first volume (1636), Fatinelli introduced the background to the Chinese Rites Controversy and the early life of Maillard de Tournon, and described the difficulties and challenges from the perspective of the legate himself during the first stage of his trip. It is

worth noting that a small part of the manuscript is highly similar to Fatinelli's *Relazione del Viaggio dall'Isola di Teneriff . . . sino à Pondisceri . . . di Monsignor C. T. M. di T.*, published in Rome in 1704 (See [Fatinelli 1704](#)). In this part, he mentions that Pope Clement XI, with good intentions, chose properly to consecrate Maillard de Tournon on 21 December 1701, since this day was both his 33rd birthday and the feast of St. Thomas the Apostle, and Tournon's middle name happened to be Thomas. According to Catholic tradition, St. Thomas was one of the twelve apostles of Jesus Christ who had been to India and even to China ([Zhang 2022](#), p. 103). As Fatinelli confirmed, the pope attached great importance to sending a legate to China on his behalf, also reflected in the fact that "there had not been such a solemn celebration in St. Peter's Basilica for centuries" (BC, Ms. 1636, f. 108r). In contrast to the accounts of previous scholars who sustained that the appointment of Tournon as vicar in the Far East with the faculty of *legatus a latere* was kept secret and any publicity avoided so as not to let the courts of France, Spain, and Portugal know anything about this mission ([Dell'Oro 1998](#), p. 325), the manuscript shows clearly that the pope's decision was not only "supported by all of Rome, but also welcomed all over Europe". (See [Fatinelli 1704](#), especially the preface). Before his departure, Tournon even met King Philip V of Spain in Naples, where he obtained Spanish protection for his mission to the Orient, and permission for his passage through the territories under the control of the Spanish Crown in the East Indies (BC, Ms. 1636, f. 110v). For this reason, the papal legation arrived in China via Manila, Philippines (BC, Ms. 1636, f. 200r). Welcomed by Philip V with great esteem, Tournon presented and described his mission and objectives, and the king himself took pains to forewarn him regarding the position of the Society of Jesus in the matter of the Chinese Rites Controversy. The Jesuits, in their efforts to avoid any unfavorable judgments on the part of the pope, had already written letters to almost all of the bishops of Europe and cardinals in the Roman Curia, explaining their position and petitioning for support (BC, Ms. 1636, f. 111r). Tournon's mission, whereby the pope sent personnel to the East directly through the papal Sacred Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith, bypassing the patronage system, was a first. The direct consequences were the opposition of the secular powers in various countries and the opening up of a dispute between different European states and the Holy See. The manuscript therefore demonstrates that, in fact, it was in the context of full public knowledge, and amidst a delicate atmosphere of tension, that Maillard de Tournon embarked on his Oriental journey, rather than in secrecy.

In the second volume (1637), Fatinelli included Maillard de Tournon's letters and reports and presented the history from the time the Legate arrived in Beijing until his "exile" to Macao. This part of the manuscript reveals a new and different perspective to what we know from Jesuit sources ([Malatesta 1994](#), pp. 211–46), particularly the *Acta Pekinensia*,<sup>14</sup> recorded by the German Jesuit astronomer and technician Kilian Stumpf (Ji Li'an 紀理安, 1655–1720). Stumpf came to China in 1694 and, after being summoned to the court in July 1695, the Emperor appointed him director of the new imperial glassworks to be set up in the compound of the French Jesuit Northern Church (Beitang). During Tournon's visit to Beijing, Stumpf was appointed by the Jesuit Visitor as procurator for the mission to handle negotiations with the papal legate. However, Stumpf's position and persistence regarding the Chinese Rites Controversy seriously irritated Tournon, who eventually refused to have further dealings with him ([Stumpf 2015](#), pp. XIX–XX). Thus, the *Istoria della spedizione*, edited by Giovanni Giacomo Fatinelli, is significant because it is the only source to include a contrasting viewpoint to that of the Jesuits that covers the whole period of Tournon's mission. He did have access to and drew on sources from the Jesuit archive, but also included the perspectives of Tournon and the Roman Curia. One good example is the question of why Kangxi's enthusiasm for this legation was so short-lived. According to the *Istoria della spedizione*, Maillard de Tournon and his entourage arrived in Beijing on 4 December 1705 and stayed in the French Jesuit Northern Church. The legate was bedridden due to illness so he had to write to Kangxi explaining the reason for his coming to China. On 27 December, Kangxi asked the Portuguese Jesuit Thomas Pereira (Xu Risheng 徐日昇, 1645–1708) and the Italian Jesuit Claudio Filippo Grimaldi (Min Mingwo 閔明我,

1639–1712)<sup>15</sup> to translate the legate's letter. However, Pereira showed a dismissive look in front of Kangxi. Soon, he put down the translation work and walked away. When he returned, he brought Henkama (赫世亨, c. 1645–1708) with him, the man in charge of the publishing house, the Wuying Dian (武英殿), who stopped the translation work altogether. By the next day, Kangxi's attitude had suddenly changed, and he became overtly suspicious of Tournon's motives for his visit. The legate firmly believed that this change in attitude and suspicion were a direct result of the interference of the Portuguese (BC, Ms. 1637, f. 8v). In addition, the legate talked about being poisoned, which caused further deterioration to his already weak body. Behind the whole incident, the legate pointed directly to Pereira, who, he argued, intended to "punish" all missionaries who did not come to China through the Portuguese Padroado. Maillard de Tournon admitted that his every movement during his stay in the capital was monitored by the emperor's favorite son Yinzhi (胤禔, 1677–1732), a supporter of the Portuguese Jesuits and a close associate of Pereira (BC, Ms. 1637, f. 47v). The manuscript also contains two different kinds of letters that the legate sent back from Beijing to Rome, with quite different tones. In addition to the official letters approved by the Qing court, there are also some "private" letters, which discuss, for example, the financial issues of the Jesuit Society in China (BC, Ms. 1637, ff. 64r–82r) and the reasons why the legate decided to ban the Chinese Rites in Nanjing (BC, Ms. 1637, ff. 128v–29v). These examples of hitherto unknown and contrasting perspectives are illustrative of why this manuscript deserves more attention from interested scholars.

In the third volume (1638), Fatinelli covered Maillard de Tournon's stay in Macao and other events that occurred after his death that are little known to most scholars. The manuscript reports that, on 30 June 1707, the legate arrived in Macao, and the Chinese officials accompanying him asked the Portuguese authorities to arrange accommodation for Maillard de Tournon. However, he was only allocated one small room, simply containing a single bed and a small table. Helpless, the legate and his entourage could only temporarily settle in the convent of the Franciscans. However, the Portuguese authorities immediately sent troops to surround the convent and did not allow anyone to approach the legate, not even the clergy of Macao. This action caused an uproar. After much coordination, Maillard de Tournon was allowed to rent a slightly larger house for three hundred guilders per year, and this residence eventually became the "prison" where he stayed until the end of his life (BC, Ms. 1638, ff. 3r–3v). Here, Maillard de Tournon met Matteo Ripa (Ma Guoxian 馬國賢, 1682–1746)<sup>16</sup> and other missionaries newly arrived from Rome, and was promoted to cardinal, receiving his cardinal's hat from the Apostolic See (Zhang 2022, pp. 190–93). This red hat, using the words of Voltaire, served only to let him die with dignity (Voltaire 1752, p. 412).

During his "exile" in Macao, Maillard de Tournon felt a lot of emotion, believing that he had been treated with courtesy by the Chinese, but plotted against by his brothers in Christ. The bishop of Macao, flattering upon his first arrival, avoided seeing him on his deathbed, refusing even to acknowledge the authority that the pope had bestowed upon him. Regarding the life of the legate during the five months before his death, a book titled *Relazione della preziosa morte dell'eminantissimo, e reverendissimo Carlo Tomaso Maillard di Tournon* (Fatinelli 1711)<sup>17</sup> was published anonymously in Rome in 1711. An examination of its content, however, reveals it to be sufficiently similar to that of the *Istoria della spedizione*, allowing us to speculate that both of them were authored by Fatinelli. At the end of the third volume of the *Istoria della spedizione*, the editor mentioned the "successor" to the first papal legate, Charles Ambrogio Mezzabarba (Jia Le 嘉樂, 1685–1741), who arrived in China in 1721 and presented the controversial "Eight Concessions". Mezzabarba transported Tournon's coffin from Macao to Rome via Brazil, and finally buried it in the chapel of the Magi in the papal Sacred Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith in 1723 (BC, Ms. 1638, f. 226r).

#### 4. Conclusions

Maillard de Tournon was the first papal legate to China in the early modern period, and his mission was significant in a number of ways. It represents the very first attempt of the Holy See to establish direct contact with the Qing court and marked a turning point in the relationship between China and the West. If Matteo Ricci started the so-called “inculturation” era, it was the failure of Tournon’s visit to China that brought this era to an end.

In 1622, Pope Gregory XV promulgated the Apostolic Decree, *Inscrutabili Divinae providentiae arcano*, announcing the establishment of the Propaganda Fide (Metzler 1974, p. 15), the purpose of which was to bypass the European powers who enjoyed the patronage of the missions, such as Portugal and Spain, to regain control of missionary activities, to transform the colonial church into a local church, to train local clergy, and to stop the imposition of European civilization and customs on the local people (Metzler 1974, pp. 24–30). From this point onward, the Holy See always attempted to send missionaries from different religious orders to every corner of the world and to gradually eliminate the monopoly of individual religious orders in certain countries or regions. In addition, the Propaganda Fide also emphasized the development of diocesan priests with the aim of laying the foundation for the “localization” of bishops and the “decolonization” of dioceses (Zhang 2022, p. 27). It was with this background and for these reasons that shortly after Clement XI was elected pope in 1701, he insisted on sending a legate directly through the Propaganda Fide to visit Emperor Kangxi.

The value of these manuscripts, preserved in the Casanatense Library, lies in the fact that they are internal documents of the Holy See that have not yet been published in their entirety. The editor used a large number of first-hand materials of the legation in order to inform Pope Clement XI and his cardinal nephews, the papal household (Camerlengo) of the Holy See, Annibale Albani (1682–1751) and Alessandro Albani (1692–1779), of both the changes in the Holy See’s policies toward China and of the details of Maillard de Tournon’s mission in the Far East. Yet, from the above description, we can also sense the limitation of this work. It tends to emphasize the absolute authority of the papacy, which opposed the Portuguese Padroado, and lessened the contribution and achievements of the Jesuits in China. In addition, this manuscript deeply influenced the later publication of the eight-volume *Memorie Storiche dell’Eminentissimo Monsignor Cardinale di Tournon*, edited by Domenico Passionei (1682–1761), which became a key document in the suppression of the Jesuits in the 18th century, prompting the Holy See to formally abolish the order in 1773 (Wright and Burson 2015).

It is likely that, in the eyes of contemporaries, this decision of Rome was too precipitate since it openly violated the interests of other European states and religious orders, thus encountering opposition by various forces, which led to the tragic end of Maillard de Tournon’s legation. In 1715, Pope Clement XI issued the decree *Ex Illa Die* on the Chinese Rites Controversy, which became a fixed point for all missionaries in their dealings with the emperor. Furthermore, in 1742, these decisions of the Apostolic See were also confirmed by Pope Benedict XIV with the Apostolic Constitution *Ex quo singulari*, which imposed obedience to the Supreme Pontiff on the part of all missionaries, prohibiting all debates (Zhang 2022, p. 206).<sup>18</sup> Therefore, without any further mention, the *Istoria della spedizione* manuscripts ended up in the vast collections of the Casanatense Library in the Eternal City. Thus far, only a few chapters have been published, and most of the contents are still relatively unfamiliar to specialist scholars in the field, in spite of their unique insights into and perspectives on a key moment in the history not only of the Holy See’s relationship with China, but also for relations with and policies toward all missionaries throughout the world.

**Funding:** National Social Science Foundation of China (21CZJ023).

**Institutional Review Board Statement:** Not applicable.

**Informed Consent Statement:** Not applicable.

**Data Availability Statement:** Not applicable.

**Conflicts of Interest:** The author declares no conflict of interest.

## Notes

<sup>1</sup> See Biblioteca Casanatense (BC), Manuscripts (Ms.) 1623, 1624, 1625, 1636, 1637, and 1638.

<sup>2</sup> See reels 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, and 42 at the Ricci Institute and their list of the manuscripts and folios copied in the Rouleau Collection; see also [Menegon \(2000, p. 36\)](#).

<sup>3</sup> See Lucca, Archivio parrocchiale di S. Frediano, *Battesimi*, 49, c. 46r.

<sup>4</sup> Scholars have long debated the true aim of Maillard de Tournon's mission in China, but a document from the Vatican Apostolic Archive (Archivio Apostolico Vaticano, AAV) clearly shows his intentions, especially at the diplomatic level; see AAV, Sec. Brev., Reg. 2509, ff. 34r–38v.

<sup>5</sup> The title was translated by the author; see [Fatinelli \(1700\)](#). It is noteworthy that this book is shown to have been published in Cologne, but the actual location was most likely the Netherlands, see [British Library \(1994, p. H1178\)](#).

<sup>6</sup> Pope Clement XI told Fatinelli about his conversation with Provana; see BC, Ms. 2419, f. 108.

<sup>7</sup> Giuseppe Maria Tommasi was a well-known figure in Rome during the 18th century and wrote numerous books related to the Bible, theology, and liturgy. Like the legate Maillard de Tournon, he was also connected to the Accademia Romana dell'Arcadia. Therefore, it is not difficult to discern why Fatinelli would have given him the manuscripts. In 1712, Pope Clement XI made him a cardinal. After his death, the works of Tommasi were organized into a collection; see ([Tommasi 1747](#)).

<sup>8</sup> Translation by the author. Luigi Vincenzo Mamiani della Rovere had served in Brazil. After returning to Rome, he became involved in the lengthy dispute over the Chinese Rites. He published Fatinelli's remarks anonymously and wrote against his position; see [della Rovere \(1709\)](#). Several years later, he published another book; see [della Rovere \(1730\)](#). Fatinelli also replied and emphasized his position; see [Fatinelli \(1710\)](#).

<sup>9</sup> It is worth mentioning that Palafox y Mendoza had written a book on Chinese history called *History of the Conquest of China by the Tartars*, which was based on the documents from the Philippines to Mexico and was first published in Spanish in 1670, followed by a French edition in the same year and then an English edition published in London in 1676. However, it was not as influential as *De Bello Tartarico* written by Martino Martini (1614–1661); see [Chen \(2003\)](#).

<sup>10</sup> Maillard de Tournon opposed the Portuguese Padroado in the Far East during his stay in China, and was boycotted and “imprisoned” by the Portuguese authorities; see [Zhang \(2022\)](#).

<sup>11</sup> Fatinello Fatinelli had been the dean of the Apostolic Chamber and was in the service of Cardinal Nicolò Acciaiuoli (1630–1719), dean of the College of Cardinals and secretary of the Supreme Sacred Congregation of the Roman and Universal Inquisition, see [Asso \(1995, pp. 320–21\)](#).

<sup>12</sup> Giovanni Battista Marcello Angelita was Maillard de Tournon's secretary during his mission in China; see [Zhang \(2022, p. 109\)](#).

<sup>13</sup> See BC, Ms. 1636, f. 1r.

<sup>14</sup> This is a Latin manuscript with a length of more than 1400 pages, which records in detail the experiences of Maillard de Tournon's mission during his visit to China, especially his life during his stay in Beijing. This work was written by the German Jesuit Kilian Stumpf who lived with the legate in Beitang, the residence of the French Jesuits in Beijing. Father Francis A. Rouleau S.J. was among the first researchers to use the work and called it “the most detailed and voluminous journal to come out of the old China mission.” See [Rouleau \(1962, p. 281\)](#). For further articles related to Kilian Stumpf and the *Acta Pekinensia*, see [Rule \(2008, pp. 17–29\)](#) and [von Collani \(1989, pp. 545–67\)](#). More recently, the manuscript has been edited and translated by the teams of Paul Rule and Claudia von Collani and is now available in English for reference; see [Stumpf \(2015, 2019\)](#).

<sup>15</sup> For Grimaldi and Tournon's Legation, see [von Collani \(1994, pp. 329–59\)](#).

<sup>16</sup> For Matteo Ripa's mission in China, especially during the period of Tournon's visit, see [Fatica \(1991\)](#). More recently, a volume has been published that concerns the years 1716–1720 and presents the chronicle of two ruptures: the first between the Holy See and China following the Apostolic Constitution of 1715 and the second between the Holy See and the Society of Jesus; see [Fatica \(2021\)](#).

<sup>17</sup> A copy can be found in the Vatican Apostolic Library; see BAV, R. G. Miscell. H. 97, int. 22.

<sup>18</sup> This led to the expulsion of many missionaries from China and the transformation of numerous churches into schools or *Citang* (temples of the ancestors); see BAV borg. cin. 516, vol. 19, 2r. It was overturned only in 1939 by the brief Instruction of the Congregation of Propaganda Fide, signed by the Prefect Pietro Fumasoni Biondi and by Celso Costantini, with a reinterpretation of the content; see [Minamiki \(1985, pp. 183–203\)](#).



## References

- Aso, Cecilia. 1995. Giovanni Giacomo Fatinelli. In *Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani*. vol. 45. Available online: [https://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/giovanni-iacopo-fatinelli\\_\(Dizionario-Biografico\)/](https://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/giovanni-iacopo-fatinelli_(Dizionario-Biografico)/) (accessed on 20 September 2022).
- British Library. 1994. *Catalogue of Books Printed in the German-Speaking Countries and of German Books Printed in Other Countries from 1601 to 1700 Now in the British Library*. London: British Library, p. H1178.
- Caputo, Ada Moricca. 1949. *Catalogo dei Manoscritti della Biblioteca Casanatense*. Roma: Istituto Poligrafico dello Stato.
- Ceccopieri, Isabella. 1988a. *Il Fondo Manoscritti della Biblioteca Casanatense*. Roma: Palombi.
- Ceccopieri, Isabella. 1988b. *Il Fondo Manoscritti della Biblioteca Casanatense*. *Accademie e Biblioteche d'Italia* 4: 22–42.
- Ceccopieri, Isabella. 1996. *Il Fondo Cinese tra i Manoscritti della Biblioteca Casanatense*. *Nazionale Archivistica Italiana (A.N.A.I.)* Notizie 2–3, August. 20–21.
- Ceccopieri, Isabella. 2022. *Il Fondo Cinese della Biblioteca Casanatense, Testi e Documenti Manoscritti dei Sec. XVII–XVIII*. Ministero per i Beni e le Attività Culturali—Indici e Cataloghi—Nuova Serie. 2 vols. Roma: Istituto Poligrafico e Zeca dello Stato.
- Cervera, José Antonio, and Ricardo Martínez Esquivel. 2018. Puebla de Los Ángeles entre China y Europa. Palafox en las controversias de los ritos chinos. *Historia Mexicana* 58: 245–84. [CrossRef]
- Chen, Min-Sun. 2003. *Mythistory in Sino-Western Contacts. Jesuit Missionaries and the Pillars of Chinese Catholic Religion*. Thunder Bay: Lakehead University Printing Services, pp. 159–72.
- Criveller, Gianni. 2012. La controversia dei riti cinesi, storia di una lunga incomprensione. *I Quaderni del Museo* 23: 14.
- De Gregorio, Vincenzo. 1993. *La Biblioteca Casanatense di Roma*. Napoli: Edizione Scientifiche Italiane.
- della Rovere, Luigi Vincenzo Mamiani. 1709. *Osservazioni Sopra la Risposta Fatta dal Procuratore del sig. Cardinale di Tournon à Cinque Memoriali del p. Provana Procuratore de' Missionari della Cina della Compagnia di Gesù*. Roma.
- della Rovere, Luigi Vincenzo Mamiani. 1730. *La Verità e L'innocenza de' Missionari della Compagnia di Gesù nella Cina. Difesa Contro un Libello Intitolato Apologia*. Roma.
- de Saldanha, António Vasconcelos. 2002. *De Kangxi para o Papa pela via de Portugal*. Lisboa: Instituto Português do Oriente, pp. 410–21.
- Dell'Oro, Giorgio. 1998. Oh quanti mostri si trovano in questo nuovo Mondo venuti d'Europa! Vita e vicissitudini di un ecclesiastico piemontese tra Roma e Cina: Carlo Tommaso Maillard de Tournon (1668–1710). *Annali di Storia Moderna e Contemporanea* 4: 325.
- Di Fiore, Giacomo. 1989. *La Legazione Mezzabarba in Cina (1720–1721)*. Napoli: Istituto Universitario Orientale.
- Di Fiore, Giacomo. 2007. Luigi Vincenzo Mamiani della Rovere. In *Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani*. vol. 68. Available online: [https://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/mamiani-della-rovere-luigi-vincenzo\\_%28Dizionario-Biografico%29/](https://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/mamiani-della-rovere-luigi-vincenzo_%28Dizionario-Biografico%29/) (accessed on 20 September 2022).
- Fatica, Michele. 1991. *Matteo Ripa Giornale (1705–1724) vol. I (1705–1711)*. Napoli: Istituto Universitario Orientale.
- Fatica, Michele. 2021. *Matteo Ripa Giornale (1705–1724) vol. III (1716–1720)*. Napoli: Unior Press.
- Fatinelli, Giovanni Giacomo. 1700. *Historia Cultus Sinensium, Seu Varia Scripta de Cultibus Sinarum, Inter Vicarios Apostolicos Gallos Aliosque Missionarios, & Patres Societatis Jesu Controversis, Oblata Innocentio XII Pontifici Maximo et Sacrae Congregationi Eminentissimorum Cardinalium Dirimendae huic Causae Praepositorum: Adjuncta Appendice Scriptorum Patrum Societatis Jesu de Eadem Controversia*. Coloniae.
- Fatinelli, Giovanni Giacomo. 1704. *Relazione del Viaggio dall'Isola di Teneriff . . . Sino à Pondisceri . . . di Monsignor C. T. M. di T.* Roma: Gaetano Zenobi.
- Fatinelli, Giovanni Giacomo. 1710. *Apologia delle Risposte Date dal Procuratore del Cardinal di Tournon ai Cinque Memoriali del p. Provana Contro le Affermazioni Fatte Sopra di esse da un Autore Anonimo*. Roma.
- Fatinelli, Giovanni Giacomo. 1711. *Relazione della Preziosa Morte Dell'ementissimo, e Reverendissimo Carlo Tommaso Maillard di Tournon*. Roma: Francesco Gonzaga.
- Fatinelli, Giovanni Giacomo. 1772. *Il Pastore della Notte Buona*. Roma: Pagliarini.
- Li, Tiangang. 2019. *Zhongguo Liyi Zhizheng: Lishi, Wenxian He Yiyi* 中國禮儀之爭：歷史、文獻和意義 (*Chinese Rites Controversy: History of literature and Significance*). Beijing: China Renmin University Press.
- Liu, Qinghua. 2008. Kangxi Shiqi Airuose Chushi Luoma Shimo Kaocha 康熙時期艾若瑟出使羅馬始末考察 (Joseph Antoine Provana's Mission to Rome in Kangxi Period). Master's thesis, Jinan University, Guangzhou, China.
- Maffei, Scipione, Vallisneri Antonio, and Zeno Apostolo. 1710. *Giornale de' letterati d'Italia II*. Venezia: Gio. Gabbriello Ertz, p. 508.
- Malatesta, Edward. 1994. A Fatal Clash of Wills: The Condemnation of the Chinese Rites by the Papal Legate Carlo Tommaso Maillard de Tournon. In *The Chinese Rites Controversy: Its History and Meaning*. Edited by David E. Mungello. Monumenta Serica Monograph Series 33; Nettetal: Steyler, pp. 244–46.
- Menegon, Eugenio. 2000. The Biblioteca Casanatense (Rome) and its China materials. *Sino-Western Cultural Relations Journal* 22: 31–55.
- Metzler, Josef. 1974. *Compendio di storia della Sacra Congregazione per l'Evangelizzazione dei Popoli o "De Propaganda Fide" 1622–1972*. Roma: Pontificia Università Urbaniana.
- Meynard, Thierry. 2018. Rentong yu Quanshi: Kangxiteshi Airuose zai Guangzhou zhi mu jiqi shidai yiyi de bianhuan 認同與詮釋：康熙特使艾若瑟在廣州之墓及其時代意義的變換 (Identification and interpretation: The Tomb of Kangxi's Special Envoy Ai Joseph in Guangzhou and the Changes in the Significance of the Times). *Journal of Sun Yat-Sen University (Social Science Edition)* 1: 31–55.
- Minamiki, George. 1985. *The Chinese Rites Controversy from Its Beginning to Modern Times*. Chicago: Loyola University Press, pp. 183–203.

- Rouleau, Francis. 1962. Maillard de Tournon, Papal Legate at the court of Peking: The First Imperial Audience (31 December 1705). *Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu* 31: 281.
- Rule, Paul. 2008. The Acta Pekinensia Project. *Sino-Western Cultural Relations Journal* 30: 17–29.
- Sforza, Giovanni. 1887. Episodi della Storia di Roma nel secolo XVIII: Brani inediti dei dispacci degli agenti lucchesi presso la corte papale. *Archivio Storico Italiano* 19: 55–74.
- Stumpf, Kilian. 2015. *The Acta Pekinensia or Historical Records of the Maillard de Tournon Legation, Vol. I*. Edited by Paul Rule and Claudia von Collani. Rome: Monumenta Historica Societatis Iesu.
- Stumpf, Kilian. 2019. *The Acta Pekinensia or Historical Records of the Maillard de Tournon Legation, Vol. II*. Edited by Paul Rule and Claudia von Collani. Leiden: Brill.
- Texeira, Manuel. 1994. Giuseppe Provana: The tomb of a Jesuit. *Review of Culture* 19: 259–69.
- Tommasi, Giuseppe Maria. 1747. *Venerabilis viri Josephi Maria Thomasii S. R. E. Cardinali S., Opera Omnia*. Roma: Palladis.
- Voltaire. 1752. *Le Siècle de Louis XIV*. London: R. Dodsley, p. 412.
- von Collani, Claudia. 1989. P. Kilian Stumpf SJ—Nachfolger des hl. Kilian in China. *Würzburger Diözesan Geschichtsblätter* 51: 545–67.
- von Collani, Claudia. 1994. Claudio Filippo Grimaldi S.J. zur Ankunft des päpstlichen Legaten Charles-Thomas Maillard de Tournon in China. *Monumenta Serica* 42: 329–59. [[CrossRef](#)]
- Wright, Jonathan, and Jeffrey David Burson. 2015. *The Jesuit Suppression in Global Context: Causes, Events, and Consequences*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Zhang, Rui. 2022. *La Missione del Primo Legato Pontificio Maillard de Tournon: All'origine delle Relazioni tra Santa Sede e Cina (1622–1742)*. Rome: Urbaniana University Press.